A Companion to Epistemology

Second Edition

edited by

JONATHAN DANCY, ERNEST SOSA,

and

MATTHIAS STEUP
A Companion to Epistemology
Blackwell Companions to Philosophy

This outstanding student reference series offers a comprehensive and authoritative survey of philosophy as a whole. Written by today's leading philosophers, each volume provides lucid and engaging coverage of the key figures, terms, topics and problems of the field. Taken together, the volumes provide the ideal basis for course use, representing an unparalleled work of reference for students and specialists alike.

Already published in the series:

1. The Blackwell Companion to Philosophy, Second Edition
   Edited by Nicholas Bunnin and Eric Tsui-James
2. A Companion to Ethics
   Edited by Peter Singer
   Edited by Stephen Davies, Kathleen Marie Higgins, Robert Hopkins, Robert Stecker, and David E. Cooper
   Edited by Jonathan Dancy, Ernest Sosa, and Matthias Steup
5. A Companion to Contemporary Political Philosophy (two-volume set), Second Edition
   Edited by Robert E. Goodin and Philip Pettit
6. A Companion to Philosophy of Mind
   Edited by Samuel Guttenplan
   Edited by Jaegwon Kim, Ernest Sosa and Gary S. Rosenkrantz
8. A Companion to Philosophy of Law and Legal Theory
   Edited by Dennis Patterson
9. A Companion to Philosophy of Religion
   Edited by Philip L. Quinn and Charles Taliaferro
10. A Companion to the Philosophy of Language
    Edited by Bob Hale and Crispin Wright
11. A Companion to World Philosophies
    Edited by Eliot Deutsch and Ron Bontekoe
12. A Companion to Continental Philosophy
    Edited by Simon Critchley and William Schroeder
13. A Companion to Feminist Philosophy
    Edited by Alison M. Jaggar and Iris Marion Young
    Edited by William Bechtel and George Graham
    Edited by Helga Kuhse and Peter Singer
16. A Companion to the Philosophers
    Edited by Robert L. Arrington
17. A Companion to Business Ethics
    Edited by Robert E. Frederick
18. A Companion to the Philosophy of Science
    Edited by W. H. Newton-Smith
19. A Companion to Environmental Philosophy
    Edited by Dale Jamieson
20. A Companion to Analytic Philosophy
    Edited by A. P. Martinich and David Sosa
21. A Companion to Genethics
    Edited by Justine Burley and John Harris
22. A Companion to Philosophical Logic
    Edited by Dale Jacquette
23. A Companion to Early Modern Philosophy
    Edited by Steven Nadler
24. A Companion to Philosophy in the Middle Ages
    Edited by Jorge J. E. Gracia and Timothy B. Noone
25. A Companion to African-American Philosophy
    Edited by Tommie L. Lott and John P. Pittman
26. A Companion to Applied Ethics
    Edited by R. G. Frey and Christopher Heath Wellman
27. A Companion to the Philosophy of Education
    Edited by Randall Curren
28. A Companion to African Philosophy
    Edited by Kwasi Wiredu
29. A Companion to Heidegger
    Edited by Hubert L. Dreyfus and Mark A. Wrathall
30. A Companion to Rationalism
    Edited by Alan Nelson
31. A Companion to Ancient Philosophy
    Edited by Mary Louise Gill and Pierre Pellegrin
32. A Companion to Pragmatism
    Edited by John R. Shook and Joseph Margolis
33. A Companion to Nietzsche
    Edited by Keith Ansell Pearson
34. A Companion to Socrates
    Edited by Elton A. Rabbe and Rachana Kamtekar
35. A Companion to Phenomenology and Existentialism
    Edited by Hubert L. Dreyfus and Mark A. Wrathall
36. A Companion to Kant
    Edited by Graham Bird
37. A Companion to Plato
    Edited by Hugh H. Benson
38. A Companion to Descartes
    Edited by Janet Broughton and John Carriere
39. A Companion to the Philosophy of Biology
    Edited by Sahota Sarkar and Anya Plutynski
40. A Companion to Hume
    Edited by Elizabeth S. Rudolph
41. A Companion to the Philosophy of History and Historiography
    Edited by Aviezer Tucker
42. A Companion to Aristotle
    Edited by Georgios Anagnostopoulos
43. A Companion to the Philosophy of Technology
    Edited by Jan-Kyrre Berg Olsen, Stig Andur Pedersen, and Vincent P. Hendricks
44. A Companion to the Philosophy of Literature
    Edited by Garry L. Hagberg and Walter Jost
45. A Companion to Latin American Philosophy
    Edited by Susana Nuccielli, Ofelia Schutte, and Ocielvo Bueno

Also under contract:

A Companion to Schopenhauer
Edited by Bart Vandenameele
A Companion to Relativism
Edited by Steven D. Hales
Contents

List of Contributors xiii
Preface to the First Edition xix
Preface to the Second Edition xxiii

Part I Ten Review Essays 1
   Skepticism and Closure Anthony Brueckner 3
   Contextualism Richard Feldman 12
   Foundations and Coherence Michael Huemer 22
   Recent Work on the Internalism–Externalism Controversy Laurence BonJour 33
   A Priori Knowledge Albert Casullo 43
   The Common Sense Tradition Noah Lemos 53
   The Power of Perception Peter Markie 62
   Virtue Epistemology John Greco 75
   Social Epistemology Alvin Goldman 82
   Bayesian Epistemology Alan Hájek and Stephan Hartmann 93

Part II Twenty Epistemological Self-profiles 107
   Robert Audi 109
   Laurence BonJour 114
   Stewart Cohen 118
   Earl Conee and Richard Feldman 123
   Fred Dretske 130
   Richard Foley 134
   Richard Fumerton 139
   Alvin I. Goldman 144
   Gilbert Harman 152
   Peter Klein 156
   Hilary Kornblith 163
   Keith Lehrer 168
   Alvin Plantinga 173
   John Pollock 178
   Ernest Sosa 185
   Barry Stroud 190
   Michael Williams 194
   Timothy Williamson 199
   Crispin Wright 204
   Linda Zagzebski 210
Part III Epistemology from A to Z 217
(Entries without author list cross references)

A 219
a priori/a posteriori Albert Casullo 219
abduction Christopher Hookway 221
absurdity Robert S. Tragesser 221
Academy (Plato) Nicholas P. White 221
act/object analysis Michael Pendlebury 222
adverbial theory Michael Pendlebury 222
agnosticism Alvin Plantinga 223
analyticity Jerrold J. Katz 224
anamnesis Nicholas P. White 230
antinomy Robert S. Tragesser 230
apodeictic Robert S. Tragesser 231
aporia Robert S. Tragesser 231
approception David McNaughton 231
Aquinas, Thomas (1225–74) Scott MacDonald 231
argument Albert Casullo 235
argument from analogy Jonathan Dancy 235
argument from illusion Richard Fumerton 236
Aristotle (384–322 bc) Terence Irwin 240
Armstrong, David M. (1926– ) Adrian Heathcote 244
association Barry Stroud 245
ataraxia Charlotte Stough 245
Augustine, St (354–430) Scott MacDonald 245
Austin, John L(angshaw) (1911–60) Graham Bird 247
avowals David Pears 249
axiomatization, axiomatics Robert S. Tragesser 249
Ayer, A(lfred) J(ules) (1910–89) Graeme Forbes 250

B 253
Bacon, Francis, Lord Verulam (1561–1626) G. A. J. Rogers 253
basic belief Matthias Steup 253
behaviourism Edward Erwin 254
belief John Heil 254
belief in and belief that John Heil 259
Bergmann, Gustav (1906–87) Laird Addis 260
Berkeley, George (1685–1753) Michael Ayers 261
Blanshard, Brand (1892–1987) Michael Williams 264
Brentano, Franz (1838–1917) R. M. Chisholm 265
burden of proof Douglas N. Walton 266

C 267
Carnap, Rudolf (1891–1970) Wesley C. Salmon 267
Cartesianism John Cottingham 268
causal theories in epistemology Carl Ginet 268
certainty Peter D. Klein 272
Chisholm, Roderick (1916–99) Richard Foley 275
circular reasoning  Douglas N. Walton  277
cogito  John Cottingham  277
cohereentism  Keith Lehrer  278
collective belief  Margaret Gilbert  281
commonsensism and critical cognitivism  Noah H. Lemos  282
concepts  Christopher Peacocke  285
Continental epistemology  Linda Alcoff  287
convention  Robert S. Tragesser  292
conversational implicature  Duncan Pritchard  293
criteria and knowledge  Bruce Hunter  294
criterion, canon  Bruce Hunter  298
critical cognitivism  299

D

Davidson, Donald (1930–2003)  Ernest Lepore  300
death of epistemology  Michael Williams  301
defeasibility  Bruce Hunter  304
definition  Robert S. Tragesser  305
Descartes, René (1596–1650)  John Cottingham  306
Dewey, John (1859–1952)  Peter H. Hare  310
dialectic (Hegel)  Kenneth R. Westphal  312
dialectic (Plato)  Nicholas P. White  313
different constructions in terms of “knows”  Jaakko Hintikka  313
direct realism  L. S. Carrier  318
disposition  John Heil  322
dogmatism  Alvin Plantinga  322
doxastic voluntarism  Sharon Ryan  322
Dutch book argument  325

E

empiricism  Bruce Hunter  326
Epicurus (c.341–271 BC)  Phillip Mitsis  331
epistemic deontologism  Sharon Ryan  332
epistemic luck  Mylan Engel  336
epistemic supervenience  John Turri  340
epistemic virtue  Guy Axtell  343
epche  Dagfinn Follesdal  347
essence (Husserl)  Dagfinn Follesdal  347
essence (Plato)  Nicholas P. White  348
essentialism  348
ethics and epistemology  Jonathan Dancy  348
evidence  Richard Feldman  349
evolutionary argument against naturalism  Omar Mirza  351
evolutionary epistemology  Edward Stein  354
existence  Christopher Hookway  356
experience, theories of  Michael Pendlebury  357
explanation  Wesley C. Salmon  361
external world  364
externalism/internalism  Laurence BonJour  364
CONTENTS

F 369
  fact/value  Robert Audi  369
  fallibilism  Adam Leite  370
  feminist epistemology  Lorraine Code  375
  first philosophy  Christopher Hookway  380
  Firth, Roderick (1917–87)  John Troyer  380
  Foucault, Michel (1926–84)  Linda Alcoff  381
  foundationalism  William P. Alston  382
  Frege, Gottlob (1848–1925)  David Bell  385
  Freud, Sigmund (1856–1939)  Jim Hopkins  387

G 389
  genetic epistemology  Richard F. Kitchener  389
  genetic fallacy  Douglas N. Walton  393
  geometry  Wesley C. Salmon  393
  Gettier problem  Paul K. Moser  395
  given, the  Alan H. Goldman  397
  Goodman, Nelson (1906–98)  Catherine Z. Elgin  400

H 404
  Habermas, Jürgen (1929– )  Hans-Johann Glock  404
  Hegel, Georg Wilhelm Friedrich (1770–1831)  Kenneth R. Westphal  405
  Heidegger, Martin (1889–1976)  Charles Guignon  408
  Hempel, Carl Gustav (1905–97)  Jaegwon Kim  409
  Hempel's paradox of the ravens  Peter Achinstein  410
  hermeneutics  Charles Guignon  412
  Hintikka, Jaakko (1929– )  Risto Hilpinen  413
  historical knowledge  Jack W. Meiland  414
  historicism  David Bakhurst  416
  Hobbes, Thomas (1588–1679)  Tom Sorell  417
  holism  Christopher Hookway  420
  Hume, David (1711–76)  Barry Stroud  420
  Husserl, Edmund (1859–1938)  Dagfinn Follesdal  423

I 425
  idea  R. S. Woolhouse  425
  idealism  Nicholas Rescher  425
  ideology  David Bakhurst  429
  illusion  431
  immediacy, presence  Alan H. Goldman  431
  in itself/for itself  M. Okrent  432
  incorrigibility  William P. Alston  433
  indeterminacy of reference  Christopher Hookway  433
  indeterminacy of translation  Christopher Hookway  434
  Indian epistemology  J. N. Mohanty  434
  indubitability  William P. Alston  438
  induction, problem of  438
  induction: enumerative and hypothetical  Gilbert Harman  438
  infallibility  William P. Alston  444
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Topic</th>
<th>Author</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>inference</td>
<td>Robert S. Tragesser</td>
<td>444</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>inference to the best explanation</td>
<td>Richard Fumerton</td>
<td>445</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>infinite regress argument</td>
<td>John F. Post</td>
<td>447</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>informal fallacies</td>
<td>Douglas N. Walton</td>
<td>450</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>innate ideas</td>
<td>G. A. J. Rogers</td>
<td>454</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>introspection</td>
<td>Vrinda Dalmiya</td>
<td>456</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>intuition and deduction</td>
<td>Robert S. Tragesser</td>
<td>460</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>intuition in epistemology</td>
<td>Bruce Russell</td>
<td>464</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>isostheneia</td>
<td>Charlotte Stough</td>
<td>468</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>J</td>
<td></td>
<td>469</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>James, William (1842–1910)</td>
<td>Peter H. Hare</td>
<td>469</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>judgement</td>
<td>John Heil</td>
<td>470</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>justification</td>
<td>Matthias Steup</td>
<td>471</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>K</td>
<td></td>
<td>472</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kant, Immanuel (1724–1804)</td>
<td>James van Cleeve</td>
<td>472</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KK-thesis</td>
<td>Risto Hilpinen</td>
<td>476</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>knower paradox</td>
<td></td>
<td>476</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>knowledge</td>
<td></td>
<td>476</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>knowledge and belief</td>
<td>Steven Luper</td>
<td>476</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>knowledge by acquaintance/by description</td>
<td>David B. Martens</td>
<td>479</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>knowledge how, who, why etc.</td>
<td></td>
<td>482</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>knowledge-seeking by questioning</td>
<td>Jaakko Hintikka</td>
<td>483</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>L</td>
<td></td>
<td>487</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Leibniz, Gottfried Wilhelm (1646–1716)</td>
<td>R. C. Sleigh, JR</td>
<td>487</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lewis, Clarence Irving (1883–1964)</td>
<td>John Troyer</td>
<td>489</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>limits of human knowledge</td>
<td>Nicholas Rescher</td>
<td>490</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>linguistic understanding</td>
<td>Christopher Peacocke</td>
<td>492</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>literature and knowledge</td>
<td>Paisley Livingston</td>
<td>497</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Locke, John (1632–1704)</td>
<td>R. S. Woolhouse</td>
<td>500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>logical construction</td>
<td>R. M. Sainsbury</td>
<td>503</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>logical empiricism</td>
<td></td>
<td>504</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>logical positivism</td>
<td>Barry Stroud</td>
<td>504</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>logicism</td>
<td>David Bell</td>
<td>506</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>lottery paradox</td>
<td>Jonathan Vogel</td>
<td>506</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>luck, epistemic</td>
<td></td>
<td>511</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M</td>
<td></td>
<td>512</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marxism</td>
<td>David Bakhurst</td>
<td>512</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>mathematical knowledge</td>
<td>Mark Steiner</td>
<td>514</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>memory</td>
<td>Tom Senor</td>
<td>520</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Merleau-Ponty, Maurice (1908–61)</td>
<td>John J. Compton</td>
<td>524</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>methodology</td>
<td>Wesley C. Salmon</td>
<td>525</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mill, John Stuart (1806–73)</td>
<td>John Skorupski</td>
<td>525</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Molyneux’s problem</td>
<td>Steve Smith</td>
<td>527</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Montaigne, Michel de (1533–92)</td>
<td>Richard H. Popkin</td>
<td>528</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moore, G(eorge) E(dward) (1873–1958)</td>
<td>Thomas Baldwin</td>
<td>529</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moore’s paradox</td>
<td>Roy A. Sorensen</td>
<td>531</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>moral epistemology</td>
<td>Jonathan Dancy</td>
<td>532</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>myth of the given</td>
<td></td>
<td>537</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CONTENTS

N
naïve realism 538
natural science, epistemology of Wesley C. Salmon 538
naturalism Philip Pettit 542
naturalized epistemology Hilary Kornblith 543
necessary/contingent David Blumenfeld 546
necessity, modal knowledge Albert Casullo 547
Neoplatonism S. Strange 548
Neurath, Otto (1882–1945) Andy Hamilton 549
Nietzsche, Friedrich (1844–1900) Alexander Nehamas 551
nihilism 552
noumenal/phenomenal James van Cleve 552
Nozick, Robert (1940–2002) Sherrilyn Roush 554
Nyāya J. N. Mohanty 556

O
objective/subjective Robert Audi 558
objectivity David Bell 559
Ockham, William of (c.1285–1347) Marilyn McCord Adams 562
ontological commitment Christopher Hookway 563
ontological relativity Christopher Hookway 564
ostensive definition P. M. S. Hacker 564
other minds Akeel Bilgrami 566

P
paradox Jonathan Vogel 572
paradox of the knower C. Anthony Anderson 572
paradoxes of analysis Felicia Ackerman 574
paranormal knowledge Patrick Grim 577
Peirce, Charles S. (1839–1914) Christopher Hookway 580
perceptual knowledge Fred Dretske 581
perspectivism 586
phenomenalism Richard Fumerton 586
phenomenology Charles Guignon 590
philosophical knowledge Felicia Ackerman 590
Plato (c.429–347 BC) Nicholas White 593
Popper, Karl (1902–94) Anthony O’Hear 597
positivism 599
pragmatism Susan Hack 599
preface paradox Earl Conee 604
presence 606
presocratic epistemology J. H. Lesher 606
prima facie reasons Jonathan Dancy 609
primary and secondary qualities Barry Stroud 609
principle of charity Ernest Lepore 613
principle of contradiction Robert S. Tragesser 613
principle of credulity William P. Alston 614
principle of identity Robert A. Tragesser 615
private language argument P. M. S. Hacker 616
probability, theories of Brian Skyrms 622
problem of the criterion Matthias Steup 626
problem of the external world  George Pappas 628
problem of induction 634
problem of other minds 634
problem of rule-following  Philip Pettit 634
problems of induction  Laurence BonJour 638
projection, projectibility  Catherine Z. Elgin 643
proof  Robert S. Tragesser 643
propositional knowledge  Robert K. Shope 644
protocol sentences  Andy Hamilton 649
psychologism  David Bell 649
psychology and epistemology  Edward Erwin 649
Putnam, Hilary (1926–)  Thomas Tymoczko 654
Pyrrhonism  Charlotte Stough 655

Quine, Willard Van Orman (1908–2000)  Christopher Hookway 657

Rationalism  Edwin Curley 659
rationality  L. Jonathan Cohen 663
realism  Philip Pettit 668
reasons/causes  Robert Audi 672
Reichenbach, Hans (1891–1953)  Wesley C. Salmon 673
Reid, Thomas (1710–96)  Keith Lehrer 674
reification, hypostatization  Christopher Hookway 676
relativism  Harvey Siegel 676
relevant alternatives  Stewart Cohen 678
reliabilism  Alvin Goldman 681
religious belief, epistemology of  Alvin Plantinga 692
religious belief, epistemology of – recent developments  Michael Bergmann 697
representation  Robert Cummins 699
representative realism  Frank Jackson 702
Rescher, Nicholas (1928–)  Robert Almeder 705
rule-following 707
Ryle, Gilbert (1900–76)  Graham Bird 709

Safety 712
Santayana, George (1863–1952)  John Lachs 712
Sartre, Jean-Paul (1905–80)  Gregory McCulloch 713
scepticism  Peter D. Klein 714
scepticism, contemporary  Peter D. Klein 715
scepticism, modern  Richard Popkin 719
Schlick, Moritz (1882–1936)  Andy Hamilton 722
scientia media 723
self-consciousness  Vrinda Dalmiya 723
self-evidence  Alan H. Goldman 723
self-knowledge and self-identity  Sydney Shoemaker 724
self-presenting  Alan H. Goldman 726
CONTENTS

Sellars, Wilfrid (1912–89) Jay Rosenberg 727
sensation/cognition Fred Dretske 729
sense-data Alan H. Goldman 732
sensitivity and safety Duncan Pritchard 732
Sextus Empiricus Charlotte Stough 736
simplicity Elliott Sober 738
social sciences, epistemology of Fred D'Agostino 739
sociology of knowledge David Bloor 744
Socrates 747
solipsism Clive Borst 747
Spinoza, Benedict (also Baruch) (1632–77) Don Garrett 749
Stoic epistemology J. V. Allen 750
Strawson, Peter Frederick (1919–2006) P. F. Snowdon 753
strong programme David Bloor 754
Suárez, Francisco (1548–1617) Jorge J. E. Gracia 755
subjectivism Richard Foley 756
subjectivity Christopher Peacocke 758
supervenience 760
surprise examination paradox Roy A. Sorensen 760

T

tabula rasa R. S. Woolhouse 763
testimony Jennifer Lackey 763
theory Wesley C. Salmon 768
transcendental arguments A. C. Grayling 768
tripartite definition of knowledge Paul K. Moser 771
truth, theories of Paul Horwich 772
truths of reason/truths of fact David Blumenfeld 777

U

underdetermination of theory Christopher Hookway 779
use/mention Matthias Steup 779

V

verificationism Barry Stroud 780
Vico, Giambattista (1668–1744) Leon Pompa 780
Vienna Circle Andy Hamilton 782

W

Whitehead, Alfred North (1861–1947) Donald W. Sherburne 783
Wittgenstein, Ludwig (1889–1951) David Pears 783

Z

zebras and cleverly disguised mules Mylan Engel 788

Index 793
Contributors

Peter Achinstein  
*Johns Hopkins University*

Felicia Ackerman  
*Brown University*

Laird Addis  
*University of Iowa*

Linda Martín-Alcoff  
*Hunter College*

J. V. Allen  
*University of Pittsburgh*

Robert F. Almeder  
*Georgia State University*

William P. Alston†  

C. Anthony Anderson  
*University of California, Santa Barbara*

Robert Audi  
*University of Notre Dame*

Guy Axtell  
*University of Nevada Reno*

Michael Ayers  
*University of Oxford*

David Bakhurst  
*Queen’s University at Kingston, Canada*

Thomas Baldwin  
*University of York*

David Bell  
*University of Sheffield*

Michael Bergmann  
*Purdue University*

Akeel Bilgrami  
*Columbia University*

Graham Bird  
*University of Manchester (Emeritus)*

David Bloor  
*University of Edinburgh*

David Blumenfeld  

Laurence BonJour  
*University of Washington*

Clive Borst  

Anthony Brueckner  
*University of California, Santa Barbara*

L. S. Carrier  
*University of Miami*

Albert Casullo  
*University of Nebraska-Lincoln*

R. M. Chisholm†  

Lorraine Code  
*York University, Ontario*

L. Jonathan Cohen†  

Stewart Cohen  
*University of Arizona, Tucson*

John J. Compton  
*King’s College, London*

Earl Conee  
*University of Rochester*