Contemporary Debates in Applied Ethics

Edited by
Andrew I. Cohen and Christopher Heath Wellman

WILEY Blackwell
Contemporary Debates in Applied Ethics
Contemporary Debates in Philosophy

In teaching and research, philosophy makes progress through argumentation and debate. Contemporary Debates in Philosophy provides a forum for students and their teachers to follow and participate in the debates that animate philosophy today in the western world. Each volume presents pairs of opposing viewpoints on contested themes and topics in the central subfields of philosophy. Each volume is edited and introduced by an expert in the field, and also includes an index, bibliography, and suggestions for further reading. The opposing chapters, commissioned especially for the volumes in the series, are thorough but accessible presentations of opposing points of view.

1. Contemporary Debates in Philosophy of Religion
   edited by Michael L. Peterson and Raymond J. Vanarragon

2. Contemporary Debates in Philosophy of Science
   edited by Christopher Hitchcock

3. Contemporary Debates in Epistemology
   edited by Matthias Steup and Ernest Sosa

4. Contemporary Debates in Applied Ethics
   edited by Andrew I. Cohen and Christopher Heath Wellman

5. Contemporary Debates in Aesthetics and the Philosophy of Art
   edited by Matthew Kieran

6. Contemporary Debates in Moral Theory
   edited by James Dreier

7. Contemporary Debates in Cognitive Science
   edited by Robert Stainton

8. Contemporary Debates in Philosophy of Mind
   edited by Brian McLaughlin and Jonathan Cohen

9. Contemporary Debates in Social Philosophy
   edited by Laurence Thomas

10. Contemporary Debates in Metaphysics
    edited by Theodore Sider, John Hawthorne, and Dean W. Zimmerman

11. Contemporary Debates in Political Philosophy
    edited by Thomas Christiano and John Christman

12. Contemporary Debates in Philosophy of Biology
    edited by Francisco J. Ayala and Robert Arp

13. Contemporary Debates in Bioethics
    edited by Arthur L. Caplan and Robert Arp

    edited by Matthias Steup, John Turri, and Ernest Sosa

    edited by Andrew I. Cohen and Christopher Heath Wellman
Contemporary Debates in Applied Ethics

SECOND EDITION

Edited by

Andrew I. Cohen
Christopher Heath Wellman

WILEY Blackwell
Contents

[*new to second edition]*

Notes on Contributors vii
Acknowledgments xiii

Introduction  Andrew I. Cohen and Christopher Heath Wellman 1

ETHICAL THEORY 11
1 *Theories of Ethics  Stephen L. Darwall 13

ISSUES IN LIFE AND DEATH 33

Abortion
2 The Wrong of Abortion  Patrick Lee and Robert P. George 37
3 The Moral Permissibility of Abortion  Margaret Olivia Little 51

Euthanasia
4 In Defense of Voluntary Active Euthanasia and Assisted Suicide  Michael Tooley 65
5 A Case Against Euthanasia  Daniel Callahan 82

Animals
6 Empty Cages: Animal Rights and Vivisection  Tom Regan 95
7 Animals and Their Medical Use  R.G. Frey 109

ISSUES IN JUSTICE 121

Affirmative action 123
8 A Defense of Affirmative Action  Albert Mosley 125
9 Preferential Policies Have Become Toxic  Celia Wolf-Devine 141

Capital punishment 157
10 A Defense of the Death Penalty  Louis P. Pojman 159
11 Why We Should Put the Death Penalty to Rest  Stephen Nathanson 175
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Reparations</td>
<td>*Compensation and Past Injustice</td>
<td>191</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Bernard Boxill</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>*Must We Provide Material Redress for Past Wrongs?</td>
<td>203</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Nahshon Perez</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Profiling</td>
<td>*Bayesian Inference and Contractualist Justification on Interstate 95</td>
<td>219</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Arthur Isak Applbaum</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>*Racial Profiling and the Meaning of Racial Categories</td>
<td>232</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Deborah Hellman</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Torture</td>
<td>*Ticking Time-Bombs and Torture</td>
<td>247</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Fritz Allhoff</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>*Torture and its Apologists</td>
<td>260</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Bob Brecher</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ISSUES OF PRIVACY AND THE GOOD</td>
<td></td>
<td>273</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Same-sex marriage</td>
<td>*Same-Sex Marriage and the Definitional Objection</td>
<td>277</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>John Corvino</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>*Making Sense of Marriage</td>
<td>290</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sherif Girgis</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pornography</td>
<td>The Right to Get Turned On: Pornography, Autonomy, Equality</td>
<td>307</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Andrew Altman</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>“The Price We Pay”? Pornography and Harm</td>
<td>319</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Susan J. Brison</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Drugs</td>
<td>*In Favor of Drug Decriminalization</td>
<td>335</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Douglas Husak</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>*Against the Legalization of Drugs</td>
<td>346</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Peter de Marneffe</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ISSUES OF COSMOPOLITANISM AND COMMUNITY</td>
<td></td>
<td>359</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Immigration</td>
<td>*Immigration: The Case for Limits</td>
<td>363</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>David Miller</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>*The Case for Open Immigration</td>
<td>376</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Chandran Kukathas</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Humanitarian intervention</td>
<td>*The Moral Structure of Humanitarian Intervention</td>
<td>391</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Fernando R. Tesón</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>*The Morality of Humanitarian Intervention</td>
<td>404</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Bas van der Vossen</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>World hunger</td>
<td>Famine Relief: The Duties We Have to Others</td>
<td>419</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Christopher Heath Wellman</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Famine Relief and Human Virtue</td>
<td>431</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Andrew I. Cohen</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Index</td>
<td></td>
<td>447</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Fritz Allhoff is an Associate Professor in the Department of Philosophy at Western Michigan University and a Senior Research Fellow in the Centre for Applied Philosophy and Public Ethics (Canberra, Australia). He has held visiting posts at the American Medical Association, University of Michigan, University of Oxford, and the University of Pittsburgh. His primary fields of research are applied ethics, ethical theory, and philosophy of biology/science. He has published work in the American Journal of Bioethics, Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics, International Journal of Applied Philosophy, and Kennedy Institute of Ethics Journal, among other places. His latest books include What Is Nanotechnology and Why Does It Matter?: From Science to Ethics (Wiley-Blackwell, 2010; with Patrick Lin and Daniel Moore) and Terrorism, Ticking Time-Bombs, and Torture (University of Chicago, 2012).

Andrew Altman is Distinguished University Professor and Professor of Philosophy at Georgia State University. He specializes in legal and political philosophy and applied ethics. His publications include Critical Legal Studies (Princeton University Press, 1989) and A Liberal Theory of International Justice (with Christopher Heath Wellman; Oxford University Press, 2009). His articles on such topics as hate speech, sexual harassment, and international criminal law have appeared in Philosophy & Public Affairs and Ethics, among other leading journals. He is currently working on a book on pornography (with Susan J. Brison).

Arthur Isak Applbaum is Adams Professor of Political Leadership and Democratic Values at Harvard University. Applbaum’s work on legitimate political authority, civil and official disobedience, and role morality has appeared in journals such as Philosophy & Public Affairs, Journal of the American Medical Association, Harvard Law Review, Ethics, and Legal Theory. He is the author of Ethics for Adversaries (Princeton University Press, 2000), a book about the morality of roles in public and professional life.
Bernard Boxill is Pardue Distinguished Professor of Philosophy at the University of North Carolina, Chapel Hill. He is author of Blacks and Social Justice (Rowman & Allanheld, 1984), editor of Race and Racism (Oxford University Press, 2001), and has published numerous articles on themes in ethics, the history of political thought, and social and political philosophy.

Bob Brecher is Professor of Moral Philosophy at the University of Brighton, and Director of its Centre for Applied Philosophy, Politics & Ethics. He has published over sixty articles in moral theory, applied ethics and politics, healthcare and medical ethics, sexual politics, terrorism and the politics of higher education. His latest book, Torture and the Ticking Bomb (Wiley-Blackwell, 2007) is the first book-length rebuttal of calls to legalize interrogational torture. Currently he is working on a theory of morality as practical reason, building on his earlier Getting What You Want? A Critique of Liberal Morality (Routledge, 1997). A past president of the Association for Legal & Social Philosophy, he is also on the Board of a number of academic journals as well as being a member of several Research Ethics Committees.

Susan J. Brison is Associate Professor of Philosophy at Dartmouth College and has held visiting appointments at Tufts, New York University, and Princeton. She is author of Aftermath: Violence and the Remaking of the Self (Princeton University Press, 2002) and Speech, Harm, and Conflicts of Rights (Princeton University Press, forthcoming) and co-editor of Contemporary Perspectives on Constitutional Interpretation (Westview Press, 1993).

Daniel Callahan is Senior Research Scholar and President Emeritus of the Hastings Center. He was its co-founder in 1969 and served as its president between 1969 and 1996. He is also co-director of the Yale-Hastings Program in Ethics and Health Policy. Over the years his research and writing have covered a wide range of issues, from the beginning until the end of life. His recent books include What Price Better Health: Hazards of the Research Imperative (University of California Press, 2003) and Taming the Beloved Beast: How Medical Technology Costs Are Destroying Our Health Care System (Princeton University Press, 2009).

Andrew I. Cohen is Director of the Jean Beer Blumenfeld Center for Ethics and Associate Professor of Philosophy at Georgia State University. His research focuses on contractarian social and political theory, themes in global justice, and reparations and apologies for historic injustice. His work has appeared in journals such as Philosophy and Public Affairs, The Journal of Social Philosophy, and The Journal of Moral Philosophy.

John Corvino is Associate Professor and Chair of Philosophy at Wayne State University in Detroit. His is the co-author (with Maggie Gallagher) of Debating Same-Sex Marriage (2012) and the author of What’s Wrong with Homosexuality? (2013), both from Oxford University Press. A frequent speaker on sexuality, ethics, and marriage, Corvino posts articles and video clips at www.johncorvino.com.

Stephen L. Darwall is Andrew Downey Orrick Professor of Philosophy at Yale University. He is the author of Impartial Reason (Cornell University Press, 1983), The British

**R.G. Frey** was Professor of Philosophy at Bowling Green State University. He specialized in ethical and political philosophy and was the author of numerous books and articles on applied ethics, normative theory, and the history of eighteenth-century British moral philosophy, including Interests and Rights (Oxford University Press, 1980) and Euthanasia and Physician-Assisted Suicide (with Gerald Dworkin and Sissela Bok; Cambridge University Press, 1998).

**Robert P. George** holds the McCormick Chair in Jurisprudence and is the founding director of the James Madison Program at Princeton University. He has served on the President’s Council on Bioethics and as a presidential appointee to the United States Commission on Civil Rights. He has also served on UNESCO’s World Commission on the Ethics of Science and Technology, of which he continues to be a corresponding member. He is a former Judicial Fellow at the Supreme Court of the United States, where he received the Justice Tom C. Clark Award. Among many other publications, he is the author of In Defense of Natural Law (Oxford University Press, 2001), Making Men Moral: Civil Liberties and Public Morality (Oxford University Press, 1995), and The Clash of Orthodoxies: Law, Religion and Morality in Crisis (Intercollegiate Studies Institute, 2002).


**Deborah Hellman** is Professor of Law at the University of Virginia School of Law. Prior to joining the UVA faculty in 2012, she was the Jacob France Research Professor at the University of Maryland School of Law. She writes about discrimination and equality, campaign finance and obligations of professional role. Hellman is the author of When is Discrimination Wrong? (Harvard University Press, 2008), which lays out a theory of discrimination, and a co-editor of The Philosophical Foundations of Discrimination Law (Oxford University Press, forthcoming).

**Douglas Husak** (PhD, JD) is Professor of Philosophy and Law at Rutgers University where he is co-Director of the Institute for Law and Philosophy. He is the author of The Philosophy of Criminal Law: Selected Essays (Oxford University Press, 2010), Overcriminalization: The Limits of the Criminal Law (Oxford University Press, 2008), Legalize This! The Case for Decriminalizing Drugs (Verso, 2002), and Drugs and Rights (Cambridge University Press, 1992). He is the Editor-in-Chief of Criminal Law and Philosophy.
**Chandran Kukathas** is Chair of Political Theory at the London School of Economics. He is the author of numerous articles and books, including *Hayek and Modern Liberalism* (Oxford University Press, 1989) and *The Liberal Archipelago: A Theory of Diversity and Freedom* (Oxford University Press, 2003).

**Patrick Lee** is the John N. and Jamie D. McAleer Professor of Bioethics and Director of the Institute of Bioethics at Franciscan University of Steubenville. In addition to numerous articles, he is the author of *Abortion and Human Life* (Catholic University Press, 1996) and *Body-Self Dualism in Contemporary Ethics and Politics* (with Robert P. George; Cambridge University Press, 2008).

**Margaret Olivia Little** is Director of the Kennedy Institute of Ethics, and Associate Professor in the Philosophy Department, at Georgetown University. She has written widely on issues of meta-ethics, normative ethics, and applied ethics. She has recently co-edited (with David Bakhurst and Brad Hooker) *Thinking About Reasons* (Oxford University Press, 2013), a compilation of essays honoring Jonathan Dancy.

**Peter de Marneffe** is Professor of Philosophy at Arizona State University. He is the author of *Liberalism and Prostitution* (Oxford, 2010) and, with Doug Husak, *The Legalization of Drugs* (Cambridge, 2005).


**Albert Mosley** is Professor of Philosophy at Smith College. In addition to writing numerous articles and book chapters, he is the author of *Affirmative Action: Social Justice or Unfair Preference?* (with Nicholas Capaldi; Rowman & Littlefield, 1996) and *An Introduction to Logic: From Everyday Life to Formal Systems* (with Eulalio Baltazar; Ginn Press, 1984). He is also the editor of *African Philosophy: Selected Readings* (Prentice Hall, 1995).


**Nahshon Perez**, is an assistant professor at the Department of Political Studies, Bar Ilan University, and a holder of a European Union Marie Curie Re-integration grant. A political theorist, his first book, *Freedom from Past Injustices*, was published by Edinburgh University Press in 2012. Aside from his research on past wrongs, rectification and property rights, his fields of research include pluralism, toleration and religion and state. His articles have appeared in peer-reviewed journals such as *Social Theory and...*
Notes on Contributors

Louis P. Pojman was Professor of Philosophy at the United States Military Academy. He authored numerous works on a wide variety of subjects in social and political philosophy.


Fernando Tesón, a native of Buenos Aires, is the Tobias Simon Eminent Scholar at Florida State University College of Law. He is known for his scholarship relating political philosophy to international law (in particular his defense of humanitarian intervention), and his work on political rhetoric. He has authored *Humanitarian Intervention: An Inquiry into Law and Morality* (3rd edition fully revised and updated, Transnational Publishers, 2005); *Rational Choice and Democratic Deliberation* (with Guido Pincione; Cambridge University Press, 2006), *A Philosophy of International Law* (Westview Press, 1998); and many articles in law, philosophy, and international relations journals and collections of essays. At the moment he is completing a book on global justice entitled *Justice at a Distance* (with Loren Lomasky). Before joining FSU in 2003 he taught for 17 years at Arizona State University. He has served as visiting professor at Cornell Law School, Indiana University School of Law, University of California Hastings College of Law, the Oxford-George Washington International Human Rights Program, and is Permanent Visiting Professor, Universidad Torcuato Di Tella, Buenos Aires, Argentina. He has dual US and Argentine citizenship.

Michael Tooley is Distinguished College Professor of Philosophy at the University of Colorado. He is co-editor (with Ernest Sosa) of *Causation* (Oxford University Press, 1993) and editor of the five-volume anthology *Analytic Metaphysics* (Garland, 1999), and the author of *Abortion and Infanticide* (Clarendon Press, 1983), *Causation: A Realist Approach* (Clarendon Press, 1987), *Time, Tense and Causation* (Clarendon Press, 1996), and *Knowledge of God* (with Alvin Plantinga; Blackwell Publishing, 2008).

Bas van der Vossen is Assistant Professor in Philosophy at University of North Carolina, Greensboro. He research focuses on political philosophy and the philosophy of law. His work has appeared in journals such as *Law and Philosophy, Politics, Philosophy, and Economics*, and the *Oxford Journal of Legal Studies*.

Christopher Heath Wellman is Professor of Philosophy at Washington University in St Louis. He works in ethics, specializing in political and legal philosophy. His

**Celia Wolf-Devine** is Emerita Associate Professor at Stonehill College. She is the author of *Descartes on Seeing: Epistemology and Visual Perception* (Southern Illinois University Press, 1993) and *Diversity and Community in the Academy: Affirmative Action in Faculty Appointments* (Rowman & Littlefield, 1997), and is co-editor (with Philip Devine) of *Sex and Gender: A Spectrum of Views* (Wadsworth, 2003).
Acknowledgments

We are grateful to Bernard R. Boxill, Dorothy Denning, R.G. Frey, Deborah G. Jonson, Hugh LaFollette, and Jeffrey Rosen for advice in the early stages. Jeff Dean, Nirit Simon, and Jennifer Bray at Wiley-Blackwell have been immensely supportive and patient. Most importantly, we would like to thank Adam Adler, Brad Champion, Chetan Cetty, Ryan McWhorter and Carson Young for providing crucial research and editorial assistance.